# The Trend of Emerging Identity Politics in Indonesia and the Challenge in Fostering Social Cohesion: Lesson Learned from Jakarta Provincial Election<sup>1</sup>

#### Kamilia Hamidah

Institut Pesantren Mathaliul Falah email: kamiliahamidah@ipmafa.ac.id

#### Abstract

Social cohesion is one important social capital to support the ongoing process of development programs and also as a guarantee for social stability. The good indication of social cohesion in a society characterized by a strong sense of belonging that encourages the desire to work together. This paper will substantively elaborate how Jakarta provincial election has strengthen the identity politics which posed great challenge to the constructed social cohesion. This paper will try to answer why identity politics was used as strategic political campaign strategies to generate massive support and how the confusion to the sentiment of identity politics has turned into the emergence of social gap in the society which leads to the disturbance of existing pattern of social cohesion. The explanation from this paper build on the basis of different media analysis throughout Jakarta provicial election on the issue related SARA (religion, ethnic and group). From this study, shows that the issue related SARA in Jakarta provincial election case was the culmination of the political ideology confrontation which give subsequent impact to the equilibrium of social cohesion in the society. [Kohesi sosial merupakan elemen penting yang menopang proses pembangunan dalam suatu masyarakat, disamping sebagai kunci utama stabilitas sosial. Indikasi eratnya kohesi sosial dalam masyarakat dapat dipahami dari kuatnya rasa solidaritas sosial, rasa memiliki dan

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

191

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Paper Presented on The 17th Annual International Conference on Islamic Studies (AICIS). "Religion, Identity and Citizenship: Horizon of Islam and Culture in Indonesia". 20-23 November 2017, Jakarta.

keinginan untuk bekerjasama. Dalam tulisan ini secara qualitatif penulis akan melihat bagaimana kasus Pilkada DKI telah memperkuat sentimen politik identitas yang memberikan tantangan baru dalam tatatan kohesi sosial yang telah terbangun di masyarakat. Dalam tulisan ini juga akan mencoba menjawab kenapa politik identitas digunakan sebagai strategi kampanye politik yang strategis untuk mendapatkan dukungan yang masif dan bagaimana persimpangan politik identitas ini membentuk gap sosial di masyarakat awam yang mengganggu stabilitas hubungan sosial yang ada. Berdasarkan data yang terkumpul dari beberapa media, baik cetak maupun elektronik, analisa media selama masa kampanye Pilkada DKI menunjukkan bagaimana isu SARA dalam kasus Pilkada DKI berujung pada konfrontasi ideologis yang mengganggu stabilitas sosial yang telah terbangun di masyarakat.]

Keywords: religion; ummah concept; social cohesion; aliran politics

#### Introduction

Indonesia as a multi-ethnic country with a pluralistic religion and sometimes facing persistence disparity of socio-economic gaps, the issue related to religion, race and ethnic still relevance in the context of Indonesia's political constellation. Although, the four pillars of Indonesia, namely NKRI, Pancasila, 1945 Constitution and Bhinneka Tunggal Ika (Unity in Diversity) as spirit of nation as well as the source of inspiration in law and any political actions, but the persistence challenge come in implementing those four pillars as part 'accepted' of Indonesian culture.

The issue related SARA (Race, Religion and Ethnic) still become important issue in Indonesia political context. The trend toward political identity become more visible during the latest Indonesia presidential election 2014 and also recently during Jakarta gubernatorial election, as the incumbent candidate Basuki Cahaya Purnama is Christian and at the same time Chinese ethnic. Various calls for Muslim to choose a Muslim leader during the political campaign -for exampleas a legitimate and democratic political aspiration for Indonesian Muslim by emphasizing as standard of religious piety.

In Indonesian context, faith based approach to politics become inevitable, particularly in the country where the persistence tendency to bring religion in politics always dominate the process of Indonesian

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

politics since the time of independence, particularly the debate over the reinsertion of the seven words in Jakarta Charter.<sup>2</sup> Although, factually Indonesia could come out from the persistence debate about the relation between religion and state in many stages, nevertheless, this polemics can always become potential political issue in any forms.

This paper will analysing the shifting trend toward intense identity politics during the latest Jakarta Gubernatorial election and will elaborate how the political process further put religious identity as social symbol for Muslim political aspiration, as well as symbol of Muslim religious piety, which shows in many form of political campaigns and political propagandas, as revealed in a survey during the Jakarta Election, where approximately 71% of Jakarta residents admitted to worry about the increasing of SARA issues.3 The impact of this election has been tremendous, and it successfully disturbing the culture of existing social cohesion within society, undermining those groups with different opinion as subordinate group on the basis of different political aspiration. However, one might said that the election is over, and the elected Governor will take the office, but the legacy of political process has shows the emerging pattern of social faction which substantially disturbing social cohesiveness and this legacy might visible in another process of the coming political election in Indonesia.

Furthermore, the issue has been successfully play an effective role in bringing identity politics to the fore and successfully generate general popular support during the election campaign, but at the same times it indicates the fragility of the social cohesiveness as indicates in raising intolerance in society during the Jakarta Gubernatorial election. According to press release by Setara Institute and Populi Centre<sup>4</sup>, the trend of political identity subsequently contributes to the raising intolerance in Jakarta. The Ahok case, however, as negative precedence



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Arskal Salim, Challenging the Secular State: *The Islamization of Law in Modern Indonesia*, (Hawai: University of Hawai Press, 2008), 85-92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> "Isu SARA Meningkat di Pilkada DKI Jakarta, Salah Siapa?" last moodified October 3rd, 2017, <u>http://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-39372353.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Intoleransi di Jakarta Meningkat Selama Masa Kampanye Pilkada DKI". Accessed October 2nd, 2017. <u>http://www.tribunnews.com/metropolitan/2017/03/23/intoleransi-di-jakarta-meningkat-selama-masa-kampanye-pilkada-dki</u>

to the future of democratic culture in Indonesia, and somehow it also threatening the future social cohesiveness as the important foundation of inclusive society.

#### Methods

In this paper, the writer will elaborate through descriptive qualitative approach, where it emphasis on the natural characteristic of the case as direct data resource which emphasis on the natural process of a case rather than emphasis merely on a result of the case. Hence, it will become the standpoint of inductive analysis which starting from the process of data collection from various resources from the time during the process of Jakarta Gubernatorial Election campaign. Because this paper use case study approach, therefore it will intensively study about the background of the present situation and also how the interaction of social environment from different level, at individual, group, institution or society in general.

The main resource of this paper relied much on media analysis, the mainstream media, social media trending, and the result from different institutions, discussion and interview through messenger platform. Also from several documents and related picture, either in the form of fake news or photos which shows the strong indication towards the visibility of identity politics is overpower during the Jakarta Gubernatorial Election campaign or after the political campaign.

From the above data collection therefore taken deductive method to get in-depth analysis on the shifting trend of political campaign into some new trends and how this new trends of political campaign strategy resulted into the disturbance of social equilibrium which then form into exclusive society which will discuss from the result of the process of data collections.

#### Result

The 2014 presidential elections marked toward shifting trend identity politics, although Joko Widodo has been elected as newly elected president and has somewhat indirectly dismissed the notion on the primordial political culture within Indonesian society is baseless. However, post 2014 presidential election has build social exclusive barrier in the society and this has become potential political commodity



to gain massive political constituents on the basis on primordial issue, particularly related to SARA.

On the momentum of the Jakarta Provincial Election, when the incumbent candidate Basuki Cahaya Purnama with the background of ethnic Chinese and a non Muslim, seemed to find a strategic loophole to re-establish the primordial sentiment in Jakarta society during the political campaign period, especially this is also reinforced by some cases from the field, which released by some media and also some surveys of the ongoing increase number of persecutions and intimidations in the period of political campaign during the Jakarta Gubernatorial Elections due to difference of political sentiment.

Based on the Kompas Research and Development Survey, shows the increasing of political choice based on religious primordial's on Jakarta elections campaign, in which the respondents of Islamic-based party tend to choose the Governor which has the same religion although their aspirations are different from the support given by party of their choice. While this phenomenon is not visible to the respondent of nationalist based party, where respondents are more dynamic and thus more fluid in the constellation of support to the three pairs of candidate, so religious factors are not the main determinants in determining the candidates for governors of their choice.<sup>5</sup>

Meanwhile, the Director of the Directorate of Crime of Police Crime of Criminal Investigation, which released by Tribunnews.com, reveals the increasing number of persecution cases in which social media is one of the cause behind the high levels of persecution, where there are at least 47 cases of persecution, some cases for example, masses for offending the FPI Grant Imam Habib Rizieq Syihab, or the persecution and beatings of teenagers in Cipinang East Jakarta.<sup>6</sup>

Meanwhile, from KontraS monitoring, released by Viva.com there have been at least 60 events since the election campaign, such as sweeping, arrest, intimidation and dissolution of groups considered as

## 195

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Nursita Sari, "Survey Litbang Kompas: Politik Aliran Kembali Naik di Pilkada DKI 2017", Accessed October 15th, 2017, <u>https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2016/12/</u>22/09015561/survei.litbang.kompas.politik.aliran.kembali.naik.di.pilkada.dki.2017.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Tribunnews.com, "Dampak Medsos, Fenomena Persekusi Meningkat Selama Pilkada 2017". Accessed October 15th, 2017, <u>http://www.tribunnews.com/nasional/</u>2017/10/17/dampak-medsos-fenomena-persekusi-meningkat-selama-pilkada-2017.

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

heretical sects. This number is becoming increasingly significant where the trigger is the number of polarization post Jakarta election campaign where the basic motive underlying the case is religion and politics. From the collected data, religious cases are massively used in the form of prohibition of monastic worship, including sealing of places of worship, the prohibition of religious activity, and these results are also reinforced by the results of Safenet records which was undertaken the survey with the Anti Persecution Coalition, where it found out at least 100 cases of persecution that occurred from early 2017 to November 2017.<sup>7</sup>

Meanwhile, from the author's observation of several online messenger groups, some political chats on political differences that occurred during the party campaign period often ended in a fierce bickering between the group members, very frequently resulted in the dissolution of the group messenger that initially had not happened any problems. Often this political difference has an impact on labelling the pro-Ahok group member with negative labels, such as lack of Islam, or even to some degree not as true Muslim as it chooses non-Muslim leaders. From the political sentiments this tendency also affects the children, for example the case of a Chinese puppeteer who is executed by his classmates due to ethnic differences.

From the above data and reports, although the persecution case is not always related to the election campaign issue, but the increasing trend of persecution case during this period of Jakarta Gubernatorial Election has more or less contributed to social tension and increased social vulnerability into social friction. The tension that occurs in social media accumulates and bursts in society in the form of riel social conflict.

The above phenomenon has increasingly polarizing the society, so that the values of social cohesion, namely 'the willingness of individual to cooperate and work together at all levels of society to achieve collective goals (Jeannote et.all 2003)'become difficult to achieve as the public mindset has been spitted so that the social

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Tim Viva, "Persekusi Marak Terjadi Sejak Kasuk Ahok", Accessed October 15th, 2017, <u>https://www.viva.co.id/berita/nasional/926654-kontras-persekusi-marak-terjadi -sejak-kasus-ahok</u>.

sensitivity to the common consciousness of the inevitability of social diversity as natural phenomenon is not established.

#### The Social Cohesion and the Medina Charter

The concept of social cohesion refer as characteristic of a society in dealing with the relations between societal unit in society, such as individual, groups, associations as well as territorial units. This concept was first introduced by Emile Durkheim as he considered social cohesion as an ordering of society and defined it as interdependence between the member or the society in the form of shared loyalties and solidarity. There are several aspect that often associated by the term social cohesion, like the strength of social relations, shared values and community interpretations, feeling of a common identity and a sense of belonging to the same community, trust among societal members as well as the extent of inequality and disparity.<sup>8</sup>

However, the term social cohesion or social integration as one of social term has been widely used in the contemporary policy development, as stated on Copenhagen Declaration and Programme Action<sup>9</sup>, the concept aim to foster society which is stable, safe, just and tolerance, and respect the diversity, equality of opportunity and participation of people. The term that often used to support this goal are 'social inclusion', 'social cohesion', and 'social capital', although somehow it may lead into endless debate, but the issue of social integration is not only imperative in the attainment of development agendas, in fact it has now become shared view that overall progress of SDG's across regions will not be possible without strengthening the social cohesion in society. Thus, promoting social cohesion to build



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> R. Berger-Schmitt, "Social cohesion as an aspect of the quality of societies: concept and measurement", *Eureporting working Paper*, No. 14. Subproject European System of Social Indicators. Mannheim: Centre for Survey Research and Methodology (ZUMA), Social Indicators Department. 2000.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> World Summit for Social Development Copenhagen; Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development; Part C: Commitments, Accessed October 3rd, 2017, <u>http://www.un-documents.net/cope-dec.htm</u>.

greater social integration can play effective role in accelerating the progress in achieving Sustainable Development Goals.<sup>10</sup>

However, the question on the possibility to make the concept of social cohesion operational, even with the persistence challenges in society, where in some case introducing the concept of social cohesion in term of integrated social policies or political process might become hard to accept, therefore this require paradigm shift so as to recognise the dignity, value and important of each person not only as an ethical norm and moral imperative but to make it as legal and binding principle and societal goal where at the end of it building common culture that, *No human being should be condemned to endure or miserable life as a result of his or her class, country, religious affiliation, ethnic background or gender*<sup>11</sup>. To achieve this goal, obviously multi-dimensional process can play critical role in promoting sustainable human development.<sup>12</sup>

However, historically from the Muslim resedence the concept of social cohesion in was substantively introduced by the Prophet PBUH which explicitly understood in Medina Charter, as the Prophet PBUH realized that strengthening social cohesion was crucial step to maintain the stability of society. The event of *Hijrah* subsequently creating social heterogeneity in Medina, which at that time Medina was not only consist of *Aus* and *Kazraj* tribes and Jews, but also *Muhajereen* and many different Arab tribes living among them. Religious plurality was also there, despite Muslim, Jews, Christianity, Sabi'in, Majusi also among them, atheist and those who worship many gods. In Short, the challenge of social plurality was there and it was to prevent potential social clash in the society raging from social and economic problem.<sup>13</sup>

In this context, introducing the concept of brotherhood was very crucial to overcome those problems, the Prophet PBUH along with all

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Alina Magdalena Manole, "*Social Coheson-A Post-Crisis Analysis*", The Buchares University of Economic Studies, Theoretical and Applied Economic, XIX No. 11 (2012): 127-134.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Implementation of the outcome of the World Summit for Social Development and of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly (A/63/133, para 8)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Paul Bernard, (1999). *SRA-491/CPRN – Social Cohesion: A Dialectical Critique of a Quasi-Concept?* Ottawa: Strategic Research and Analysis Directorate, Department of Canadian Heritage, 1999.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Badri Yatim, Sejarah Peradaban Islam, (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2013).

social component agreed to build social contract to regulate the social relationship among society. The social contract which well known as "Medina Charter" (Mitsaq al-Madinah), considered the first ever written constitution in humanitarian history. The Charter was not only very advanced in its time, but also the only important document in the development of constitutional and legal habits in the Islamic world.<sup>14</sup>

In the document of the Charter, it is said that human beings for the first time introduced, among others, to the insight of freedom, especially in the field of religion and economy, as well as social and political responsibility, in particular the defence together. "In the Charter also places the individual rights of freedom to embrace religion, social solidarity, interfaith brotherhood (al-ukhuwwah), peace, tolerance, justice (*al-'adalah*), not discriminate other and respect the diversity". In this charter, the Prophet Muhammad unites them into three elements: First, they live in Medina as a place to live together and work together, secondly, they are willing to be united in as one *ummah* to realize harmony and benefit together and they accepted Muhammad Saw as the supreme leader and legitimate political authority in their lives and this authority was supplemented by a regulatory institution called the Medina Charter which applies to individuals and each group.<sup>15</sup>

Here the concept of 'Ummah' refer to a society consisting of various social groups agreed upon social bond of humanity that makes them ummah wahidah. Therefore it can be said that the ummah formed by the Prophet Muhammad in the city of Medina is inclusive, because the Prophet did not form a political society exclusively for the Muslims alone, rather the Prophet PBUH gathered all the communities or classes of the people of Medina, both groups either those who received his monotheistic message or who do not accept his message. At least there are two fundamental basic values in establishing and building Medina State: first, the principle of equality and justice, (almusawah wal-



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Muhammad Husain Haekal, *Sejarah Hidup Muhammad*, (Jakarta: Litera Antarnusa, 1990), 199-205.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Masykuri Abdillah, "Gagasan dan Tradisi Bernegara dalam Islam: Sebuah Perspektif Sejarah dan Demokratis", *Jurnal Tashwirul Afkar* 7 (2000):97. See Suyuthi Pulungan, *Prinsip-Prinsip Pemerintahan dalam Piagam Madinah Ditinjau dari Pandangan al-Qur'an*, (Jakarta: Rajawali Press dan LSIK, 1994), 68.

'*adalah*), secondly, inclusive. These two principles are embedded in the form of several other humanistic values, such as: consistency (i'tidal), balanced (tawazun), moderate (tawasut) and tolerance (tasamuh), where all of these values serve as the ideal and operational foundation for social-community relations that covers all aspects of life, whether political, economic, or legal and become important foundation in fostering social cohesion that further bring toward social integration.

In this way, the concept of 'Umma' Zakiyuddin Baidhawy<sup>16</sup> refers into several categories of integration: Firstly, the concept of Umma as spiritual integration. The Islamic doctrine of Ones and Prophet hood as the substance of universal brotherhood, beyond ideological tied and beyond race, the argument of hereafter about reward for every good deeds of the people performed during his life and punishment for the bad deeds played critical role in formulating the morality of the society. Secondly, the concept of 'Umma' as economic integration, during the Makah period there was aristocratic system in economy, where wealth and family line make group of people attain social privilege, those unfortunate people get exploited and lead into social disintegration, because social welfare is neglected. In this way, the introduction of concept of zakah as a process of redistribution of wealth and at the same as a process of social integration. Thirdly, the concept of 'umma' as social integration. As shows many Qur'anic verses the prohibition of Riba' (usury) and at the same time the obligation of Zakah, Shodaqat, Hibah and many others, as the process of wealth redistribution which become source of social integration. Fourthly, the concept of 'Umma' as social integration, where clearly mentioned in Qur'anic verses the importance to build the society on the basis of morality, justice and honest. Fifthly, the concept of 'Umma' as political integration, as shows by the establishment of Medina as physical state, where it was the culmination of Islamic value in the form of formal state, although it was not clear what kind of government, but what we learn from the establishment of Medina was that, the norms and the spirit of humanity was there.

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Wawan Gunawan et al, *Fikih Kebhinekaan, Pandangan Islam Indonesia Tentang, Umat, Kewarganegaraan, dan Kepemimpinan Non Muslim*, (Bandung: Mizan Pustaka, Bandung, 2015), 135-143.

However the spirit of Medina Charter and the idea of respecting diversity should become important historical precedence for the Muslim in Indonesia and as spirit to build greater social solidarity from different background of the society.

Although, constitutionally, Pancasila for Indonesian as considered state national principle which come out upon the circumstances of a very pluralistic society, moreover the 1945 Constitutions in the Preamble and Article  $29^{17}$  (1) of the Constitution says that the Indonesian state is based on the belief and only God. In principle, Article 29 (2) says that the state shall guarantee the freedom to embrace religion and to worship according to the religions. The first National Principle of *Pancasila* 'Believe in the One supreme God' has resemblance normative value of human right and in this principle, it can be understood that its aim to guarantee everyone's rights and protection of religious freedom. Thus, Pancasila as state principle as well as a safeguard for social solidarity to maintain social integration.

Unfortunately, the reality of diversity within Indonesian society making Indonesia vulnerable for possible social fiction. The persistence challenge of violations against freedom of religion and belief continue to increase as the awareness about the nature of social diversity has not culturally realized by most of the common people. This social phenomena lead into the emergence of socio-religious exclusive community, which may bypass the state authority in pursuing the -socalled- religious interest. Therefore, it is very unfortunate, despite constitutional protection and constitutional guarantee on religious diversity, Indonesia, according to the press released by Coordinator of The Human Right Commission on Freedom of Religion and Belief said that report on violations against freedom of religion and belief continue to increase every year. Human Right Commission notes that there are 87 reports by 2015. The number is increasing compared to 2014, which is 74 reports,<sup>18</sup> while SETARA Institute recorded 208 incidents of violations of freedom of religion / belief with 270 forms of action, spread across 24 provinces. Most violations occurred in West Java, with

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Indonesian Constitution

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>Achmad Zulfikar Fazli, 25 Kasus Intoleran Terjadi di Indonesia sepanjang 2016, Accessed October 15th, 2016, <u>http://news.metrotvnews.com/hukum/8N0YX4wb-25-kasus-intoleran-terjadi-di-indonesia-sepanjang-2016.</u>

41 Violations with high numbers also occurred in DKI Jakarta (31 incidents) and East Java (22 incidents)<sup>19</sup>. Interestingly, still according to SETARA Institute, from 270 act of violation of freedom of religion or belief, 140 acts of violation involving state apparatus and actors, where 123 of them by commission while 17 acts is an act of omission. 130 acts which done by non-state actors, which means individuals citizens and individuals who are members of community organization.

The 2016 report from Setara Institute on violation of freedom of religion as published by Tirto.id<sup>20</sup> recorded 208 incident with 270 forms of actions, where a total 123 acts of violation were perpetrated by state actors in active form such as provocative statements of public officials and inviting violence, and 17 events were omissions. In addition, there are 130 actions carried out by non-state actors with the highest perpetrators being 42 citizens. While in 2017 there have been 155 incidents, recorded with 201 forms of actions. A total of 75 acts of infringement involve state actors, i.e. 71 in the form of active action, 3 actions by rule, while 1 other act is an act of omission. A total of 126 acts were committed by non-state actors with the highest perpetrators being citizen groups, i.e. 28 actions.

The aforementioned report shows how the persistence challenge of intolerance is exist as threat in nurturing social cohesion, also this situation is further exacerbated with negative sentiment from certain socio-religious group of society by agitating the common people, considering that governmental public policies has failed in bringing prosperity and social justice for the society as whole, adding the possibility towards fragmented society. Very frequently, the minority group of the society become vulnerable target of intolerance, because considered as 'the other' and it could become an easy and strategic way in consolidating political power or political popularity that ultimately leads into exclusive identity politics which emerged due to the weakening civil society influence as buffer against early warning of

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

 $102\,I$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Setara Institute, Kondisi Kebebasan Beragama di Indonesia 2016, Accessed 15th October 15th, 2017, <u>http://setara-institute.org/kondisi-kebebasan-beragamaberkeya kinan- dan-minoritas-keagamaan-di-indonesia-2016/.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Scholastica Gerintya, "Benarkah Intoleransi Antar Ummat Beragama Meningkat?", Accessed October 15th, 2017, <u>https://tirto.id/ benarkah-intoleransi-antar-umat-beragama-meningkat-cEPz</u>.

The Trend of Emerging Identity Politics in Indonesia and the Challenge in Fostering Social Cohesion: Lesson Learned from Jakarta Provincial Election

intolerance and also the weakening political commitment to maintain social solidarity by giving equal right. Which seems to be mostly a matter of political rhetoric and personal calculation rather then for the sake of maintaining national integration.

#### Discussion

As the persistence threat of intolerance has been always visible as challenge for the nature of Indonesian diversity, while at the same times, at the global level, the trend toward the raising of identity politic also getting more room to exist in many forms, as predicted by many social scientist<sup>21</sup> on the global resurgence of religion, Because, religion commonly consider as a symbol of identity, and thus religion often used as a shield to preserve the comfort zone, in the form of justification for an action, mobilizing the masses to commit anarchy, or as a tool for stakeholders to gain mass popularity, obscuring the substance of religion from 'a way of life' into means to achieve something, rather than as a sacred principles of governing life.<sup>22</sup> Some of the symbols of religious identity which are associated with religious values, beliefs, scriptures, rituals, religious leaders, and religious institutions often dragged for a particular interest and farther away from its core teaching.

Religion as an ideology as well as an identity, therefore vulnerable to be used for specific interest, it is because religion could promote the sense of exclusiveness among its adherents so as to bring sense of superiority, which is to some extend lead into extreme intolerance-both culturally and structurally-toward building single truth claim which might followed expansionist ideology in the name of God. Therefore, religion can be as trigger the deepest set of beliefs among people, religion also can easily manipulated with fear and pride, particularly in terms of power dynamics. Thus, religion is an emergent, complex adaptive network of symbol and myth that, on the one hand, figure schemata, thinking and acting in ways that lend meaning and



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Fabio Petito and Pavloz Hatzopaulos (ed.) *Religion in International Relation; The Return from Exile*, (USA: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Taufik Abdullah, "Sekitar Masalah Agama dan Kohesi Sosial: Pengalaman dan Tantangan", *Jurnal Masyarakat dan Budaya* 11 No.1 (2009): 7-15.

purpose of life and the other, disrupt, dislocate and disfigure every stabilizing structure.  $^{\rm 23}$ 

From the Jakarta Gubernatorial election campaign and how the raising case of intolerance during the political campaign period has indicate how political supporters has used issue related SARA for political purpose, where according to the survey of *Indikator Politik Indonesia*<sup>24</sup>, Burhanuddin Muhtadi (Media Indonesia 16/10/2017) affirm the importance of the role of religion in delivering Anies victory in the second round. He further stated that almost 60% Anies voter who use their rights in the second round of the Jakarta Gubernatorial elections were based on religious similarities, where only 10% voters think they can bring change, only 6% because of the program, and less than 6% for other reason. From this released dates it is difficult to deny the fact that religion as the major contributing factors for Anies victory on Jakarta Gubernatorial election.

The level of voters satisfaction on the election process is an important socio-capital for Anies-Sandi but at the same time they have huge task to knit back the unravel social solidarity as the legacy of the election process, where political wound was not only among political elites but it much more severe among the common people.

The case of the body of a 78 year old grandmother was abandoned by the surrounding community (Liputan6.com, 10/03/2017). The reason was, the grandmother who had not been able to walk long ago have choose Basuki Tjahaja Purnama (Ahok) and Djarot Saiful Hidayat during the first round election of DKI.<sup>25</sup>

This reconciliation is obviously not easy considering the level of polarization that occurs in many layers of society, the currently elected governor need hard struggle to increase public acceptance within wounded society, because even though Ahok-Djarot was defeated, the post-election survey according to *Indikator Politik Indonesia* still

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Mark C. Taylor, *After God*, (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2007), 12. As delivered by Professor Patrice Brodeur during KAICIID South and Southeast Asia Fellowship Programme, Mindanao, Philippines, 23-27 May 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Burhanuddin Muhtadi, "Anies dan Masa Depan Jakarta", Accessed October 15th, 2017, <u>http://www.mediaindonesia.com/news/read/127415/anies-dan-masa-depan-jakarta/2017-10-16</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> <u>http://news.liputan6.com/read/2882270/jenazah-nenek-hindun-ditelantarkan-warga-setelah-pilih-ahok</u>, last modified October 19, 2017.

recorded that Ahok-Djarot Administration approval rating in range of 77%. Which means the newly elected government could not easily discontinue or reforming the ongoing program of the predecessor governor because it would decrease their popularity among their constituent and obviously it would threaten their public legitimacy.

Moreover, the first speech of the Governor of DKI Jakarta Anies Baswedan after his inauguration sparked a controversial conversation on social media related to his decision to use the word 'native' (*pribumi*). Some social media users were not surprised when the word came after a series of Jakarta election campaigns filled with identity politics.

BBC Indonesia reported (BBC Indonesia 17/10/2017) more than 77,500 tweets mentioning 'native' in less than 24 hours after Anies inaugural speech and it reached more than 133,000 tweets on Tuesday (17/10), although Anies emphasis that the word used in the context of colonialism, but the context of colonialism used by Anies seems responded differently by some social media users, where some still feel that the word mark as 'dog-whistle politics' which means one thing to specific community but has different and more specific meaning to a particular group.<sup>26</sup> On this issue, Mahfudz MD said that juridical Anies may not be wrong, but politically it seems unethical after the whole episode of identity politics throughout the gubernatorial political campaign. Anies should realized that his inaugural speech for some group will be considered as racist message, despite since the reformation era we tend to erase the term 'inlanders' and 'noninlanders', although according to civil law this regulation is not cleared, but politically look racist and discriminative.<sup>27</sup>

The Central Bureau of Statistics (BPS), as released by Tirto.id<sup>28</sup> also shows that the elections of Jakarta have an influence that causes the decrease of DKI Jakarta Democracy Index in 2016, from 85.32 in

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> "Mengapa Istilah 'Pribumi' dalam Pridato Anies Baswedan Memicu Kontroversi?". Accessed, October 18th, 2017, <u>http://www.bbc.com/indonesia/trensosial-41648172</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Moh. Mahfud MD, "Pidato Pribumi Anies". Accessed October 21, 2017, https://nasional.sindonews.com/read/1250287/16/pidato-pribumi-anies-1508505278.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Scholastica Gerintya, "Benarkah Intoleransi Antar Ummat Beragama Meningkat?". Accessed October 15th, 2017, <u>https://tirto.id/benarkah-intoleransi-antar-umat-beragama-meningkat-cEPz.</u>

2015 to 70.85 in 2016-or down by 14.47 percent. This decline has been the greatest decline as compared to other provinces in Indonesia, where in fact, in 2015; DKI Jakarta had become the province with the highest Democracy Index in Indonesia with the number 85.32 percent. Thus, the gubernatorial election in Jakarta indicates that political factors can affect issues and sentiment towards religion.

Hence, the post-Jakarta gubernatorial election, despite leave the society fragmented and divided that would be difficult to heal in any time soon; there are several others legacies that can be deducted from the above elaboration;

Firstly, identity politics still become strategic way to generate general support from the masses and as effective way to build common solidarity that based on primordial sentiment related to religious, ethnic or group sentiment, this trend might become potential strategy for the future election. Secondly, on this condition, political aspiration and political loyalties, which is shown on people's political party choice, not on the basis of political accountability or capabilities but on the basis of religious and ethnic sentiment, thus it become structural barrier for newly candidate with no substantial socio-cultural ground to be politically accepted. Thirdly, raising the insensitivity of the common people become more visible, particularly in relation with for those who has different religious affiliation or ethnic affiliation. and simultaneously eroding the prevailing existing value in the society, namely-the value of tolerance toward the diversity, the value of mutual cooperation (gotong royong)-which subsequently disturbing the social cohesion. Fourthly, the raising number of exclusive groups, people become more sensitive when discussing some issue related to religion and ethnic or some particular groups or society, therefore increasing the potentiality of social conflict. All of these legacies brought into fore rampant hate speech which is to some extent end up to the miserable levels, eroding interrelation decency, losing socio-ethical sensitivity and therefore unhesitatingly attacking different people blindly.

### Conclusion

Jakarta Provincial Election has indirectly given a clear picture of how making SARA (issue related to religion, ethnic or race) as a political campaign strategy has resulted in the polarization of society and raising of primordial's sentiments, all of which is bad precedence

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

for the sustainability of social cohesion in society and further threatens the people's resilience to the possibility of social friction while the tendency put SARA sentiment to generate popular support has placing the common people as exploited political commodities rather than empower them to be politically matures.

This should become a common lesson for all parties on the necessary to build common awareness to maintain social cohesion, particularly following the coming 2019 national election. The fact that the rising trend of the social religiosity of the society should be balanced with the awareness on the development of a culture of tolerance which departs from the classical president of their respective religious teachings, so that of course involving interfaith religious figures to actively participate as important role play in the society and at the same time as goalkeeper for social and community resilience by actively developing virtuous social of character.

The prevalence potential of politicization of SARA in the coming National General Election and the 2019 Presidential Election, should be an important note; first, the organizer of the General Election, especially in law enforcement and police to accelerate the performance of law enforcement on the actions of SARA campaign that violate article 69 letter b of the Regional Head Election Law, Article 160 paragraph (1) of the Criminal Code and Article 28 junco Article 45 paragraph 9 (2) The ITE Law, secondly, Contestants, political parties and political candidate support groups should avoid the politicization of SARA as a bad way in electoral political competition, because it would threaten social harmony, social cohesion and national integration of Indonesia as the nation and state of Pancasila Unity in Diversity.

On the other hand, continuous effort by many social activist as well as all component of social community in building awareness about the inevitability of diversity through social engineering efforts aimed at building a culture of tolerance from below, some approach including firstly; plural society should open up the door to accommodate all political interests derived from all segment of living societies. Because all of the interest groups they are interrelated components in the society, so that their political aspirations need to be contiguous and just political education to their political constituent and maintaining social solidarity especially during the political campaign.

> Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

> > l 107

Secondly, in plural society should enforce social system which will accommodate all existing social entities, this sort of cultural policy in order to give equal place for all cultural groups to manifest their cultural identity and their uniqueness, so that the cultural diversity should recognized as part of national treasure which will contribute for the national and character building, by giving remarkable support for any intercultural and intercommunity social engagement program.

The key of national integration depend on the recognition and the acceptance of the existing cultural diversity, therefore the need of the readiness and sincerity from all component of society to respect each other culture without spouting its own cultural identity and it is expected that they could life together in respect and cooperation, as building a culture of just and tolerance is not only about norm but moreover it also part of religious ethics, thus the growing global religiosity should come together with nourishing the culture of tolerance, because with tolerance the evolution of culture of peace can be pursued which ultimately as important condition toward the culture of democracy.

#### **Bibliography**

- Abdullah, Taufik. "Di Sekitar Masalah Agama dan Kohesi Sosial: Pengalaman dan Tantangan", *Jurnal Masyarakat dan Budaya* 11 No. 1 (2009): 7-15.
- Anwar, Dewi Fortuna. "Foreign Policy, Islam and Democracy in Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Social Science and Humanities* 3 (2010): 37-54
- Belshaw, Belshaw (ed.) et al. *Faith in Development*. USA: Regnum Book International. 2001.
- Berger-Schmitt, R. "Social cohesion as an aspect of the quality of societies: concept and measurement." *Eureporting working Paper*. No. 14. Subproject European System of Social Indicators. Mannheim: Centre for Survey Research and Methodology (ZUMA). Social Indicators Department. 2000.
- Bernard, Paul. Social Cohesion: A Dialectical Critique of a Quasi-Concept? Ottawa: Strategic Research and Analysis Directorate, Department of Canadian Heritage. 1999.

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

- Gunawan, Wawan (ed.), et al. Ma'arif Institute Fikih Kebhinekaan, Pandangan Islam Indonesia Tentang, Umat, Kewarganegaraan, dan Kepemimpinan Non Muslim. Bandung: Mizan Pustaka. 2015.
- Haekal, Muhammad Husain. Sejarah Hidup Muhammad. Jakarta: Litera Antarnusa, 1999.
- Hayness, Jefrey (ed). *Routledge Handbook on Religion and Politics*. London: Routledge. 2009.
- Magdalena Manole, Alina. "Social Cohesion-A Post-Crisis Analysis." *The Buchares University of Economic Studies, Theoretical and Applied Economi.* 11 (2012):576. Implementation of the Outcome of the World Summit for Social Development and of the twentyfourth special session of the General Assembly (A-63/133).
- Masykuri Abdillah. "Gagasan dan Tradisi Bernegara dalam Islam; Sebuah Perspektif Sejarah dan Demokratis." *Jurnal Tashwirul Afkar* 7 (2000): 97.
- Petito, Fabio, and Pavloz Hatzopaulos (ed.). Religion in International Relation; The Return from Exile. USA: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003.
- Salim, Arskal. Challenging the Secular State: The Islamization of Law in Modern Indonesia. Hawai: University of Hawai Press, 2008.
- Sandal, Nukhet, and James, Patrick. "Religion and International Relations Theory: Towards a Mutual Understanding." *European Journal of International Relations* 17 (2010):3-25. doi:10.11. 1177/1354066110364304
- Suyuthi, Pulungan. Prinsip-Prinsip Pemerintahan dalam Piagam Madinah Ditinjau dari Pandangan al-Qura'an. Jakarta: Rajawali Press dan LSIK. 1994.
- Taylor, Mark C. After God. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 2007. Lecture delivered by Professor Patrice Brodeur during KAICIID South and Southeast Asia Fellowship Programme, Mindanao, Philippines, 23-27 May 2016.
- World Summit for Social Development Copenhagen. "Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development; Part C: Commitments. Accessed October 3rd, 2017. <u>http://www.un-documents.net/copedec.htm</u>.
- Yatim, Badri. Sejarah Peradaban Islam, Jakarta: Rajawali Pers. 2013.

Copyright (c) 2018 by Karsa. All Right Reserved DOI: 10.19105/karsa.v26i1.1653

### l 109