

## TADRIS: JURNAL PENDIDIKAN ISLAM

http://ejournal.iainmadura.ac.id/index.php/tadris E-ISSN: 2442-5494; P-ISSN: 1907-672X



# Consumer Behavior in Choosing Madrasah Education Institutions: Kotler's Perspective

## Hasan Baharun<sup>1</sup>, Ulfa Diana<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> Universitas Nurul Jadid Probolinggo, Indonesia Email: ¹ha54nbaharun@gmail.com, ²fhadyana@gmail.com

## Abstract

#### Keywords: Consumer Behavior; Determination; Kotler's Perspective.

The purpose of this study is to investigate the community's choice-making behavior using Kotler's four-pillar model: product, price, place, and promotion. This study uses a qualitative approach with a case study. In-depth interviews with key informants, along with careful observation and recording gained during the field study, were the primary methods for data collection. The method of data analysis was carried out cyclically, with the stages of data display, data reduction, and conclusion serving as the checkpoints. According to the research findings, cunsomer behavior in choosing madrasa education institutions is influenced by marketing stimuli/mix, in addition to other stimuli and buyer responses. The findings of this research have ramifications for the necessity of management of educational institutions knowing the desires and requirements of the community for the path of institutional development.

## Abstrak:

Kata Kunci: Perilaku Konsumen; Penentuan; Perspektif Kotler. Riset ini bertujuan untuk memahami dan menganalisis tentang perilaku masyarakat dalam menentukan pilihannya terhadap lembaga pendidikan madrasah perspektif Kotler, yaitu product, price, place, dan promotion. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif jenis studi kasus. Pengumpulan data diperoleh dari wawancara dengan informan, observasi dan dokumentasi yang diperoleh selama kegiatan penelitian di lapangan. Teknik analisis data dilakukan secara sirkuler melalui tahapan display data, reduksi data dan penarikan kesimpulan. Hasil penelitian menunjukan bahwa perilaku konsumen dalam memilih lembaga pendidikan madrasah didasarkan pada marketing stimuli / mix, other stimuli, buyer respon. Penelitian ini memberikan implikasi tentang pentingnya para pengelola lembaga pendidikan dalam memahami keinginan dan kebutuhan masyarakat terkait dengan arah pengembangan lembaga.

Received: February 17, 2023; Revised: May 23, 2023; Accepted: June 26, 2023.

https://doi.org/10.19105/tjpi.v18i1.8422

© © ®

© Tadris Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Institut Agama Islam Negeri Madura, Indonesia

This is an open access article under the CC-BY-NC license

## 1. Introduction

Education is fundamental significance to the purpose of human life. It is assumed that a good education will lead to the community achieving the expected success level, developing individuals' skills, and forming excellent character in individuals. Through education, qualified individuals will be formed as expected by the goals of education itself. Education is the primary means of improving the quality of human resources. The advancement of a society, nation and country is also determined by the progress of education. In general, most people do not believe in the importance of education, so many children do not go to school or rarely continue their education to a high level.

The community will become the foundation for the improvement and quality of education services provided by the school so that a harmonious relationship between the school and the community will significantly impact the quality of education. 4 If the community assists, the learning facilities and facilities provided by the government are fulfilled according to the needs for use by students, with the provision of qualified teaching staff and provision. 5 There is an exciting factor in the community where there is an institution, namely a public elementary school and Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, which are in the same area. However, the community prefers sending their children to madrasah Ibtidaiyah. Historically, the quality of public schools is better than private ones because teachers teach them with civil servant status. Apart from that, public schools are free and not burdened with fees or tuition fees per month. The community is more inclined to Madrasah Ibtidaiyah or private schools regarding the number of students in these institutions. Parents of students as secondary users of educational institutions have an essential role in determining which educational institution is best for their children.6

Islamic education is improving in quality; a feature of the increasing quality of Islamic education today is the large number of people who want to educate their children in religious education institutions. One such characteristic is enhancing educational standards in madrasas and other establishments operating under the umbrella of Islamic boarding schools. Madrasah students

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> I Kusuma and others, 'The Role of Brand Image and Brand Trust through Electronic Word of Mouth in Creating Parent's Interest to Sending Children to School', *Technium Soc. Sci. J.*, 35 (2022), 477.

Wardoyo, Irvan Iswandi, and Kartini, 'Animo Orang Tua Menyekolahkan Anak Di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Nahdlotur Rijal Kroya Indramayu', *Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat Waradin*, 2.1 (2023), 35–49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Fathul Fauzi, 'Peningkatan Profesionalisme Guru Melalui Supervisi Klinis', *EDUSIANA: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam*, 7.2 (2020), 109–28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Abu Rashed Osman and others, 'Vindicating Service Quality of Education through Structural Equation Modeling (SEM): International Students' Perspective', *International Journal of Higher Education*, 9.3 (2020), 158–72 <a href="https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n3p158">https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n3p158</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Wiwik Angranti, 'Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Menyekolahkan Anak Ke SMK Swasta Di Tenggarong', *INTELEGENSIA: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 5.1 (2020), 49–59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Fredy Fredy, Yonarlianto Tembang, and Ratna Purwanty, 'Analisis Kepuasan Orangtua Dan Siswa Terhadap Kualitas Layanan Pendidikan Dasar', *Musamus Journal of Primary Education*, 2.1 (2019), 59–66 <a href="https://doi.org/10.35724/musjpe.v2i1.1874">https://doi.org/10.35724/musjpe.v2i1.1874</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> M. Jamil, Iman Jauhari, and Dahlan, 'The Response of Pesantren Community toward the Ideology of Islamism: A Study of Pesantren Teachers' Perception in North Sumatra', *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 10.2 (2019), 204–23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Moh Roqib, 'Increasing Social Class through Islamic Boarding Schools in Indonesia', *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 12.2 (2021), 305–29.

often win national and worldwide competency events. Islamic education is part of Islamic teachings since its goals are inseparable from those of human existence in Islam: to generate servants of Allah SWT. With Islamic education, students understand what is good and evil and with that indirectly know the meaning of togetherness, tolerance, and can adapt to differences. The educational process in this direction can be pursued through multicultural education. Parent educators Consumers now consider education rationally. Consumer behavior in picking educational institutions for their children; parents change their minds about enrolling their children in madrasahs.

The Nurul Jadid Foundation's Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Az-Zainiyah II in Karang Anyar Village has more students than comparable government-run schools. Therefore, the villagers of Karang Anyar are more dominant in Islamic elementary schools because the community believes that the quality of religious knowledge in the madrasah is high. The quality of education places the community as the top priority of educational programs or outputs. Satisfied customers indicate an educational institution's success.

The community is increasingly advanced and developing, making the community's demands for the development of educational institutions large, so it is possible for educational institutions that are unable to accommodate the demands of the community to hurt these institutions. <sup>11</sup> In One of the educational programs at MI Az-Zainiyah, Before entering the class, the students are required to read the holy Koran, pray and read Asmaul Husna. After that, they are required to perform the Duha prayer in the congregation. This program has received positive value and the public's trust in the high quality and high level of religious knowledge at MI.

Most people in Karang Anyar Village, Dusun Grinting, always take their children into Islamic boarding schools after graduating from elementary school or the equivalent. Therefore, the community is more concerned with the high knowledge of their religion than in general so that if their children enter boarding schools, they feel familiar with the religious sciences that will be studied later when they are in the boarding school. Within educational institutions, especially schools, the quality of education has different views by various parties. Most of the parents of students view the quality of education in schools can be judged by the learning achievements of their children. In other words, productivity is an extraordinary attraction to attract the attention of the public and prospective students to choose educational institutions. The increasing number of prospective students or guardian parents who expect their children to study at these educational institutions is a barometer of the competitiveness of these educational institutions.

54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Abdah Munfaridatus Sholihah and Windy Zakiya Maulida, 'Pendidikan Islam Sebagai Fondasi Pendidikan Karakter', *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, Dan Agama*, 12.01 (2020), 49–58 <a href="https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v12i01.214">https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v12i01.214</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Dian Permana and Hisam Ahyani, 'Implementasi Pendidikan Islam Dan Pendidikan Multikultural Pada Peserta Didik', *Jurnal Tawadhu*, 4.1 (2020), 995–1006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Novi Ariyanti and Muhammad Anggung Manumanoso Prasetyo, 'Evaluasi Manajemen Hubungan Masyarakat Dan Sekolah (Studi Kasus Di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Miftahul Falah Purwodadi Pasuruan)', *Idarah (Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kependidikan)*, 5.2 (2021), 103–26 <a href="https://doi.org/10.47766/idarah.v5i2.133">https://doi.org/10.47766/idarah.v5i2.133</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Istanto Istanto, 'Kepemimpinan Inovatif Kepala Madrasah Dalam Meningkatkan Daya Saing Madrasah', *Al Qalam: Jurnal Ilmiah Keagamaan Dan Kemasyarakatan*, 16.6 (2022), 1991–2006.

The results of previous research related to consumer behavior, also called consumer behavior, have been carried out by Baharun et al. 13 said that Value Added, Excellent Performance Image, Blended Learning Method, Health Protocol Policy, and Repetitive Activities are the five factors influencing consumer behavior regarding selecting educational institutions during a pandemic. According to Winarno et al., 14 consumer research and marketing strategies should prioritize achieving high levels of customer satisfaction. According to Indra and Adi 15, green marketing has a favourable impact and a substantial influence on the behavior of consumers.

Utama<sup>16</sup>says that consumer behavior is dynamic, including an interactive relationship between affective and cognitive behavior and the environment. Consumer behavior also involves! exchanges between two or more parties. Where each party gives and receives something of value. Yuniawati<sup>17</sup> states that several consumer behavior factors influence the decision-making process, namely cultural, social, personal, and psychological factors. This opinion is reinforced by Hadi et al.<sup>18</sup>, who state that consumer decisions in choosing a product/service are influenced by three things, namely 1) Environmental/external influences, which consist of cultural factors, social class, personal influences, family, and situations; 2) Effect of Individual/Internal Differences 3) Psychological Influence. Compared. In contrast to the opinion of Oktarini<sup>19</sup>, which states that final conditions greatly influence consumer decisions in choosing educational institutions, considering that prices are a very sensitive part.

Based on the previous studies above, this research aims to analyze people's behavior in determining their choice of madrasa educational institutions from the Kotler perspective (4P), namely product, price, place, and promotion. This is the novelty of this research, in which researchers use Kotler's theory as a basis for dissecting phenomena that occur in the field. Through this research, it is hoped that new scientific contributions will be obtained in developing Islamic educational institutions.

<a href="http://jurnal.staiannawawi.com/index.php/At-Tarbiyat/article/view/331">http://jurnal.staiannawawi.com/index.php/At-Tarbiyat/article/view/331</a>.

Satrio Winarno, Lisbeth Mananeke, and W.J Imelda Ogi, 'Analisis Pelayanan Konsumen Dan Fasilitas Terhadap Kepuasan Konsumen Kedai Kopi Maxx Coffee Cabang Hotel Aryaduta Manado', *Jurnal Emba*, 6.3 (2018), 1248–57.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> H Baharun and others, 'At-Tarbiyat: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam', *The Behavior Of Customers Choice In Educational Institutions*, 04.03 (2021), 1–14 <a href="http://jurnal.staiannawawi.com/index.php/At-Tarbiyat/article/view/331">http://jurnal.staiannawawi.com/index.php/At-Tarbiyat/article/view/331</a>.

Putu Agus Indra Purnama and Nyoman Rasmen Adi, 'Green Marketing Dan Quality Brand Sebagai Prediktor Perilaku Konsumen Dan Dampaknya Terhadap Keputusan Pembelian Produk', *Jurnal Manajemen Bisnis*, 16.1 (2019), 185 <a href="https://doi.org/10.38043/jmb.v16i1.2027">https://doi.org/10.38043/jmb.v16i1.2027</a>>.

Rahmad Faisal Utama, 'Kajian Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Perilaku Konsumen Dalam Keputusan Pembelian Kopi Wine CK Street', *Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Pertanian*, 1.4 (2021), 1–15.

<sup>(2021), 1–15.</sup>Yuniawati, 'Pengaruh Guru Dan Teman Sebaya Terhadap Keputusan Peserta Didik Dalam Memilih Lembaga Bimbingan Belajar (Studi Pada Lembaga Bimbingan Belajar Primagama Driyorejo – Gresik )', *Jurnal Pendidikan Akuntansi, Universitas Negeri Surabaya*, 2015, 1–9.

Surabaya, 2015, 1–9.

18 Abdul Hadi, 'Konsepsi Manajemen Mutu Dalam Pendidikan', *Idaarah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 2.2 (2018), 269 <a href="https://doi.org/10.24252/idaarah.v2i2.5260">https://doi.org/10.24252/idaarah.v2i2.5260</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Riri Oktarini and Rahmayanti, 'Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Keputusan ( Studi Empiris Pada Sma Imtek Pagedangan Tangerang )', *Jurnal Ikmiah Ilmu Sekertaris/Administrasi Perkantoran*, 7.2 (2020), 140–46.

## 2. Methods

This study used a qualitative methodology with a case study to investigate cunsomer behavior towards decisions in choosing educational institutions. Also, a descriptive-analytic approach is used to assess data connected to research difficulties. This research targets Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Az-Zainiah II, Paiton, Probolinggo, East Java. The selection of the research site was based on the quality of education possessed by the Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Azzainiah II, where this madrasah has its charms parents of students to enrol their children in the institution. This madrasa pays attention to community satisfaction as users and partners of the madrasa.

To obtain accurate and accountable information, researchers use purposive sampling techniques, in which researchers determine informants based on their understanding of the information needed by researchers. The informants for this study consisted of the principal, the Deputy Head of Curriculum, the Council of Teachers, and student guardians. Researchers conducted in-depth interviews about the innovations made by the institution while studying the leading academic programs to gather information about why parents tend to choose Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Azzainiah II as an educational institution for their children. This allowed the researchers to obtain information about why parents make this choice.

The display analysis of all the interviews with associated parties was used to collect the data, followed by the observation and study of the documents received during the research activities conducted in the field. When making observations, careful consideration was given to the requirement that the interview process advances naturally so that attention could be maintained on the scheduled sub-chapters. The information that is then used to support and enrich the information gathered through the Observation process comes from Secondary Data in the form of crucial documents that agencies own.

This research's data analysis method used data reduction, which, in this context, refers to an analysis process that organizes, directs, and gets rid of unneeded information. The act of presenting data is accomplished by presenting the data in an informative manner. The researcher can better understand the situation and determine whether or not to make the appropriate conclusions as a result of doing so. Drawing conclusions and verifying those conclusions, which is done during the process of research and the process of data reduction

## 3. Result and Discussion

The results of the discussion show that consumer behavior in the selection of educational institutions, according to Kotler's theoretical perspective, is based on the following:

# 3.1 Marketing Stimuli

Every educational institution has a marketing strategy, often interpreted as a system designed or designed to assist the management of educational institutions in creating, changing and maintaining an educational program strategy and creating a vision for the institution in the future. After concluding that marketing is a social and managerial process, either by individuals or groups, to get what is needed and wanted through creating offers and exchanging products of value with other parties, several professionals in the field of marketing and educational marketing provide an understanding that, after reaching this conclusion, is provided by marketing and educational marketing.<sup>20</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Syamsul Arifin, 'Marketing Pendidikan', *Tadris: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pemikiran* 

The results of interviews with the MI Azainiyah II school principal stated that the study of marketing or marketing in the world of education is comprehensive, including requiring a manager of an Islamic education institution to carry out a strategic analysis to identify various opportunities, various opportunities. What the principal said is true that educational institutions put forward the dynamics of management of Islamic education which are competitive and different, and there are also unique ways of marketing.

One of the educational marketing strategies at MI Azzainiyah is using marketing stimuli. This strategy is used to introduce madrasas to the community so that they can benefit them directly or indirectly; in other words, madrasas provide Islamic education programs for the community to meet their hopes and need for the birth of knowledgeable and morally good children. Through this strategy, it is hoped that the community will trust the madrasah to enrol their children in the institution.

A marketing stimulus, which may also be referred to as a marketing mix, is a marketing mix that refers to a sequence of actions or techniques that an organization utilizes in the process of advertising services or products. MI Az-Zainiyah II uses marketing stimuli in the world of education in order to increase public or consumer interest in schools at the Institute The intense competition between educational institutions requires that each institution provide innovation and advantages to attract prospective parents and students so that these educational institutions continue to exist in society. In this case, the institution believes that the program alone is not enough to convince every parent or consumer to choose an educational institution. An educational strategy is needed, namely by using marketing stimuli. Marketing stimuli or what can be called the marketing mix applied by the MI Azzaiyah II institution consists of 4 P, namely;

#### 3.1.1 Place

Selecting the proper distribution to convey all the activities of educational institutions and places is the main thing that needs to be considered in selecting educational institutions, especially for every parent or consumer. Access MI Az-Zainiyah II is easy to reach, a comfortable environment supports the teaching and learning process, and has a large building and courtyard. The results of interviews with the principal of MI Az-Zainiyah II said that the location of MI Az-Zainiyah was indeed strategic because it was on the side of the road, making it easier for parents to take their children to school, this was also a reference for why most parents sent their children to MI Az-Zainiyah II.

From the results of interviews with the deputy principal, he added that any damage to school facilities and infrastructure both outside the classroom and inside the classroom at MI Az-Zainiyah II,We are as the teacher council try to immediately repair with existing human resources, such as providing paving in the yard of MI Az-Zainiyah II so the schoolyard looks neat and clean seem neat and clean and also provide comfort for students doing activities outside the classroom, this is an added value to attract consumers or the public to enter or study at the MI Az-Zainiyah II institution. Both Kotler and Keller believe that location is one of the most critical factors in determining one's level of success. Choosing a community is the first step in determining location. The possibility for economic growth and stability, levels of competition, the political climate, and other factors will weigh strongly into this decision.<sup>21</sup>

Pendidikan Islam, 14.1 (2020), 112–23 <a href="https://doi.org/10.51675/jt.v14i1.75">https://doi.org/10.51675/jt.v14i1.75</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Dewa Gede Agung Artha Swikara Putra, Ni Wayan Eka Mitariani, and I Gusti Ayu

## 3.1.2 Price

Price is the amount consumers must pay to obtain a product/service. According to an interview with the madrasah treasurer, MI Az-Zainiyah did not withdraw monthly tuition fees, and the determination of the tuition fee depended on the determination of the school or institution. Not withdrawing the monthly SPP does not mean that MI Az-Zainiyah II is not qualified. According to President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, quality education has a curriculum, teaching materials, methodologies, systems and infrastructure that are developments in the current information age. Therefore, the school quality does not have to be expensive. After being reviewed directly by the researchers, it turned out that free monthly tuition fees were set at MI Az-Zainiyah II because seen from the segment of residents or the majority of the community around MI Az-Zainiyah II had a middle to lower economy, the institution set a price withdrawal only on LKS or student textbooks.

The cost of education is a critical factor situation. Because of the cost of education, the educational process will be easier to run. To achieve an increase in the quality of education, it is necessary to have good management of education costs so that the quality of education is fulfilled according to the standards of education funding set by government regulations. Funding has a significant role in an institution, including in educational institutions.<sup>23</sup>

## 3.1.3 Promotion

Consumers are provided with information and influenced about products or services supplied by educational institutions through marketing activities, which increases the likelihood that customers will desire to use the products and services offered by educational institutions. In interviews with the deputy principal, he added that even though the majority of students at MI Az-Zainiyah were local people or those around the madrasa, the school still held a presentation or promotion. This was the case even though most students at MI Az-Zainiyah were local people. It is necessary to promote the school since, even with an excellent program, it will be challenging to persuade every parent to enrol their child in MI Az-Zainiyah II without a marketing connection strategy. This approach intends to make the planning programming at MI Az-Zainiyah II capable of entering the brain window of the community and potential consumers and effectively strengthening the positive image of schools and foundations as their primary institutions.

From the results of research conducted by researchers, one of the indicators for promotion at MI Az-Zainiyah II is the installation of banners that are strategically located on the side of roads that residents commonly pass, promotions from the community around MI Az-Zainiyah II, and school achievements at the district and district levels. With achievements, the community will know what has been achieved in learning and education.

Imbayani, 'Pengaruh Lokasi, Persepsi Harga Dan Citra Sekolah Terhadap Keputusan Orang Tua Murid Memilih Jasa Pendidikan Di Sekolah Dasar Jambe Agung Batubulan, *Jurnal Emas*, 2.April 2022 (2021), 51–70.

Mukhlison Efendi and Nur aini Latifah, 'Penetapan Harga Jasa Pendidikan Di Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Negeri (PTKIN)', Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran, 2.2 (2021) (2021), 127–43.

Dea Chairyani, K.A Rahman, and Muazza, 'Pengaruh Biaya Pendidikan Terhadap Mutu Sekolah Di Sekolah Menengah Pertama Swasta', *Jurnal Visionary: Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Dibidang Administrasi Pendidikan*, 2022.

## 3.1.4 Product

Competitive advantage is like achievements in a competition; companies must continue formulating a strategy to achieve competitive advantage. When a company can create superior value in competition, it will get many benefits, starting from a good view of consumers towards their products to increase company profits; a competitive advantage strategy can be used as the basis for company progress. A product produced by a school or educational institution is the curriculum and programs within the school where the product attracts consumers to enrol their children in the institution. It is undeniable that every educational institution must have a unique program which is a product, to attract IM consumers as the head of the school. He stated that the main attraction of MI Az-Zainiyah II is its superior curriculum and program so that most of the people around Karang Anyar, Grinting Village, entrust or send their children to school. at MI Az-Zainiyah II. It was proven that LQ as the guardian of students at MI Az-Zainiyah, explained that he chose MI Az-Zainiyah II to entrust his child because, Usually, elementary schools only provide a schedule of religious learning material once per week. Even then, the period is only up to 1 hour of subjects. Meanwhile, if a child goes to school in MI, he will get more religious education. This is because material related to this education is made more often over time.

The following are the flagship programs included in the curriculum at Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Azzainiyah II.

Table 1. Main Madrasah Programs

NO	SUPERIORITY
1	Religion Based Curriculum
2	Memorizing the Qur'an and its meaning with the An-Nasr method
3	Scout Extracurricular
4	Drumband extracurricular
5	Private for students who are not fluent in reading

## 1. Religion based curriculum

Islamic education in Indonesia has been recognized by society and the government for a long time. Moreover, many educational institutions have already been established with the aim of education. Madrasah is the character of an Islamic educational institution, which is the primary identity that must be reflected in the curriculum and educational process.<sup>24</sup> MI Az-Zainiyah II proves that even though Madrasah Ibtidaiyah is a school with the scope of Islamic religious education, it has two curricula that go hand in hand, namely the blend of science and technology with the basis of religion itself being able to compete with other institutions, as evidenced by a large number of quality inputs in intelligence, morals, or other matters. The results of interviews with the Deputy Head of the Curriculum Sector, MI Az-Zainiyah II, confirmed this. That with the addition of religious knowledge it does not eliminate general knowledge. So do not be surprised if you see MI children who are good at reading the Qur'an, studying Figh, to Tajweed, but also very good at doing Science, English, and so on. MI Az-Zainiyah II guarantees quality output and can compete with other well-known institutions. As proof, Siyayatul Widad, a class III student, won first place in the sub-district level art competition.

-

Wina Khaerunisa and others, 'Pendidikan Islam Dalam Persepsi Masyarakat ( Studi Kasus di DTA Sirojul Falah II , Telukjambe', Madrasah Sebagai Alternatif Pelaksanaan Pendidikan Islam Dalam Persepsi Masyarakat, 8.2 (2021), 164–77.

## 2. Memorizing the Qur'an and its meaning with the An-Nasr method,

Institution or madrasah believes it is essential to have a unique program that can be used as an appreciation in the community. So unique characteristics distinguish one school from another so that the local community's interest in the madrasa increases. The only programs put forward can be related to character education or memorization of the Qur'an for students. Among the interests of consumers in sending their children to MI Az-Zainiyah II is the existence of the tahfidz al-Qur'an program at the institution by applying the an-Nasr method. -Nasr is a flagship program at MI Az-Zainiyah II. The interview with the Principal stated that the institution in Uin Malang obtained this program. At that time, MI Az-Zainiyah II was conducting a comparative study at Uin Malang. This nasr is only in MI Az-Zainiyah II.

Tahfidzh Al-Qur'an is one of the techniques for learning the Qur'an in early childhood. According to Rifa'i, learning is the most accessible lesson for children. Because the Tahfizhul Qur'an program has simple learning techniques, that is, it is enough to hear and say it repeatedly, be it listening to our reading or hearing other people's reading.<sup>25</sup> The application of the tahfidz an-nasr method at MI Az-Zainiyah II is by reading and repeating it every morning before the teaching and learning activities take place. The results of interviews with the Deputy Head of Curriculum Division at MI Az-Zainiyah II stated that early childhood memorization very quickly, therefore the institution programs students only to read over and over again the holy verses of the Qur'an and their meanings in the congregation and deposit their memorization every week from what has been recorded in their brains from the repeated recitation of the holy verses of the al-Qur'an or juz amma every day. The statement from the curriculum representative that by simply programming students with the reading method, students are iudged to be able to memorize and remember every verse that is read, considering that the memorization they have memorized becomes an SKL (institutional graduation requirement) at MI Az-Zainiyah II at the time of graduation of class VI. The institution will appreciate the best students who memorize the Qur'an and its translation using the an-Nasr method.

## 3. Scout extracurricular

Scouting activities for the younger generation are closely related to character education outside school. At present, every human scout activist must respond to the demands of changing times positively. Presenting fun, exciting and challenging scouting activities.

From the results of interviews with the Principal of MI Az-Zainiyah II, scouting activities are one of the interactive and progressive learning scouting methods. The formed activity in scouts is in the form of group activities. The activity method trains a scout to work together during practice and competence. Activities carried out in the open with exciting and challenging themes for students.

The benefits of scouting can be felt really for students who are serious about taking part in scouting. Active in the unit/troop council, for example, for enforcement scouts. It may take time, but you get more experience than inactive people. The results of interviews with the principal said that with the scouting activities, they hoped to provide new experiences for students and attract community interest in sending their children to MI Az-Zainiyah II. Likewise, student parents also hope that the goal of participating in extra scouting activities

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Faisol Hakim and Yovita Dyah Permatasari, 'Tren: Pendidikan Tahfidz Qur'an Pada Anak Di Rumah Qur'an Ar-Roudhoh Rowotengah', *Auladuna: Jurnal Prodi Pendidikan Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 2.2 (2020), 19–26 <a href="https://doi.org/10.36835/au.v2i2.375">https://doi.org/10.36835/au.v2i2.375</a>.

will not only be rigging. Every scout must grow and develop soft skills, skills, and abilities.

## 4. Drum band extracurricular

Drumband is an organization to deepen the knowledge of MI Az-Zainiyah II students about music and how to play musical instruments, especially drum band musical instruments. Drumband is packaged as an extracurricular, especially at MI Az-Zainiyah II. From the results of interviews with the Deputy Head of the MI Az-Zainiyah Curriculum Field, the drum band extracurricular is a place for students who can play musical instruments. So they can develop and express themselves through the art of music. The drum band extracurricular course is open to all MI Az-Zainiyah II students.

From the results of interviews with the Head of MI Az-Zainiyah II, The objectives of the drum band's extracurricular are; 1) A place for students to develop and express themselves by playing musical instruments, 2) Maintain and increase their knowledge of the art of music through activities carried out, 3) Accommodate and accommodate gifted students in the art of music.

# 5. Private for students who are not fluent in reading

The results of interviews with the Head of the School in dealing with the problems of students who are not fluent in reading, the Principal, who is also a private program facilitator for students who are not fluent in reading at MI Az-Zainiyah II, then develops special services or guidance by starting to identify students who cannot read from the Madrasa.

This activity aims to make students able to read fluently because if students are not fluent in reading, it will affect Madrasahs and reduce community interest in sending their children to MI Az-Zainiyah II. After all, there are still many graduates who need help to read fluently. From the results of interviews with the Deputy Head of the Private MI Az-Zainiyah Curriculum Field, this is conducted every Wednesday and Thursday after the break time.

The description above explains that consumer behavior to influence consumers in selecting educational institutions requires marketing stimuli which include product, place, price, and promotion. Stimulus marketing is a marketing package as the primary means of influencing consumers. However, some other stimuli or stimuli will be considered in consumer behavior decisions in consuming products or services.

#### 3.2 Other Stimuli

The conclusions drawn from my conversations with the Headmaster of MI Az-Zainiyah II School This model of consumer behavior offers an insight that consumer behavior is impacted by the circumstances and situations of the society in which they grow and develop. These circumstances and situations influence consumer behavior. This indicates that consumers come from several layers of society and environment, each of which will have evaluations, needs, opinions, attitudes, and tastes; consumers have built-up characters and are susceptible to influence.

## 3.2.1 Cultural

Culture is the primary determinant, and the behavior of a person who is born in a particular place will follow his culture too, for example, in choosing an educational institution not because of the achievements or excellence of the educational institution but following his father, mother or older brother who is also an alumnus or has attended school at that educational institution. This statement is valid from the results of research and interviews with the parents of students at MI Az-Zainiyah II, who stated that they chose the MI Az-Zainiyah educational

institution because he was also alumni of MI Az-Zainiyah II, so that was the reason the parents sent their children to MI Az-Zainiyah II. Cultural factors have a broad and profound influence on consumer behavior towards the selection of educational institutions; culture is the most basic determining factor in one's desires and behavior because culture concerns all aspects of human life.

## 3.2.2 Technological

The existence of technology is very influential in the world of education, especially in the marketing field. Thus marketing/marketing schools can be done quickly without any space and time restrictions; using this technology can also introduce school quality effectively and efficiently. As a component of education, schools must continue to improve their abilities and skills in managing an educational institution to introduce educational products to the broader community through societal developments. Research indicates that MI Azainiyah II has formed a PPDB Team which promotes through social media such as websites, Facebook, WhatsApp, etc. The use of promotional media that is carried out will have an impact on the targets set by the school, so it needs promotional media to highlight the characteristics of the school as well as being a place for school promotion.<sup>26</sup> The PPDB team also implements online and real-time New Student Admissions (PPDB). One of the goals of implementing the PPDB online program is that madrasas seek to ensure that the acceptance of new students can be carried out according to the provisions determined by madrasas, namely objective, transparent, accountable, and non-discriminatory.

From the explanation above, the Kotler perspective consumer behavior model confirms that marketing stimuli and other stimuli are included in the buyer's black box or the buyer's black box, meaning internal factors that influence consumer decisions, which contain various factors that are in one's mind; why? The people in Karang Anyar village prefer MI Azzaniyah II over various other educational institutions.

## 3.2.3 Buyer Characteristics

Madrasah often carries out institutional promotions through several achievements, special programs, quality of graduates, and so on to gain the public's trust. With high public trust in madrasas, a mutual relationship will be obtained between the two. Therefore, in order to understand the user community, MI Azzainiyah II seeks to recognize and understand the characteristics of the customers it will serve so that they will have more confidence in the educational process offered.

First, Always compare because reality is faced with choices. When choosing or assessing a school, customers always compare it with other schools or institutions. If somewhere there are several competing institutions, then we will find the customer characteristics to compare these institutions. Second, more selective in consuming products/services. Customers choosing a school or taking advantage of educational outcomes such as graduating from a school are always selective. Do not necessarily or quickly choose a school or take advantage of school graduates before going through several selections or specific assessments. Customers always sort and choose which schools are by their wishes and which are not. Third, the bargaining position is high. Customers have a high bargaining position because they significantly contribute to the school.

Intan Mutia, Wahyu Nur Cholifah, and others, 'Pemanfaatan Teknologi Interaktif Sebagai Media Pembelajaran Dan Promosi Sekolah', Jurnal PkM (Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat), 5.5 (2022), 487–93.

Schools must pay more attention to them so they do not switch to other institutions.



Figure 1. Buyer decision proses

The buyer decision process is how consumer behavior is in choosing an educational institution at MI Az-Zainiyah II; this involves five basic steps in deciding to choose an educational institution: recognizing a need, searching for information, evaluating, purchasing, and postpurchase evaluation.

The decision-making process begins when the buyer recognizes a problem or need. A consumer moved by stimuli will try to find more information by product category and buyer characteristics. Consumers can obtain information from several sources. Consumers evaluate choices in terms of expected benefits. Then they narrowed their choices until they finally chose one of the alternatives. Two factors can influence purchasing decisions. The first factor is the attitude or position of other people, for example, close friends. The second factor is situational factors that cannot be anticipated, for example, income. Postpurchase behavior is the stage of the buyer decision process in which consumers take further action after purchase based on their satisfaction or dissatisfaction.<sup>27</sup>

Based on the background of the problem or rationale mentioned above, the problem underlying the following discussion is regarding the condition of the dimensions of the marketing mix, which consists of product, cost, place, promotion, human resources, physical evidence, and process at MI Az-Zainiyah II in Karang Baru and the influence the dimensions of the marketing mix consisting of product, price, place, promotion, human resources, physical evidence, and the process of the student's decision to choose MI Az-Zainiyah II. After entering the buyer's black box, namely the internal decision of the consumer in determining the next stage of the educational institution.

## 3.3 Buyer Response

Consumer response is that every behavior is a response/reply to a stimulus.<sup>28</sup> The characteristics of each consumer heavily influence consumers' responses after consuming goods or services. Consumers with the characteristics of high income, young age and highly educated will have a different response from those with low income, old age and low education, even though they value the same thing.

The language response will appear if a language stimulus precedes it. Explains that the response is any activity caused by a stimulus. Stimulus functions as an opening conversation interaction. Every stimulus or speech stimulus conveyed by a speaker in communication is a form of obtaining a response effect, either in the form of a verbal or nonverbal response. The

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Asyidatur Rosmaniar, 'Pengaruh Bauran Pemasaran Jasa Terhadap Keputusan Siswa Memilih Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan Swasta Di Surabaya', *Journal Kinerja*, 16.1 (2019), 22–33.

W Sari and R Erwin, 'Analisis Respon Konsumen Terhadap Kualitas Pelayanan Pada Puskesmas Taraman Semendawai Suku III Ogan Komering Ulu Timur', *Jurnal Trisnariset*, 1.2 (2021), 45.

response results from a stimulus or speech stimulus in the form of a response from the interlocutor to the speaker's speech in conversational interactions. The response given produces feedback that functions as a closing speech. The speaker wants action or response from the interlocutor to do something as he wants.29

#### 3.3.1 Product choice

Products can be sold to the market to be noticed, owned, utilized, or eaten to satisfy a want or a need.<sup>30</sup> Products can be anything from food to electronics to clothing to services. According to interviews conducted with the Head of School in education services, the products provided to pupils include a reputation, future employment opportunities, and several different options. Good schools provide a high reputation and quality of education, as well as prospects for students after they graduate and a choice of concentrations in a wide variety of programs so that prospective students can select a field that is conducive to their particular set of skills and interests. MI Az-Zainiyah II has a particular program, namely the tahfidzul Qur'an an-nars method, which is the product of choice for the surrounding community; Tahfidzul Qur'an, the an-nars method itself, is memorizing juz 30 and their meanings. This excellent program is mandatory for MI Az-Zainiyah II students and a graduation requirement at MI Az-Zainiyah II.

## 3.3.2 Brand choice

According to Kotler, a positive image of a brand in the eyes of consumers makes it more probable that those consumers will make purchases of the brand. A strong brand also serves as the foundation for developing a positive image for an organization<sup>31</sup> Becoming the brand of choice for the public or customers is undoubtedly the desire of every educational institution. This means that the community accepts the products offered by institutions or schools. The principal of the MI Az-Zainiyah II school stated that the number of sales transactions measured brand choice. One program that is of great interest to the community at MI Az-Zainiyah II is its flagship program.

The products offered by the MI Az-Zainiyah II school to customers are products that globally can be realized within the school's vision, namely to become quality output rahmatan lil alamin. The program also has two variants: the regular program and the Featured program. A unique program is required for all students, namely the tahfidz ul Qur'an with the an-Nasr method.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Muria Khusnun Nisa and others, 'Moderasi Beragama: Landasan Moderasi Dalam Tradisi Berbagai Agama Dan Implementasi Di Era Disrupsi Digital', Jurnal Riset Agama, 1.3 (2021), 79–96 <a href="https://doi.org/10.15575/jra.v1i3.15100">https://doi.org/10.15575/jra.v1i3.15100</a>.

Bambang Wiyono, 'Produk-Produk Jasa Pendidikan', *Intizam: Jurnal Manajemen* 

Pendidikan Islam, 3.2 (2020), 35-45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> FAJRI DWIYAMA, 'Brand Image: Upaya Memasarkan Pendidikan Bagi Lembaga Yang Kurang Mampu Bersaing', Adaara: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, 9.2 (2019), 880-91 <a href="https://doi.org/10.35673/ajmpi.v9i2.424">https://doi.org/10.35673/ajmpi.v9i2.424</a>.

## 4. Conclusion

By the description of the results of the research and discussion above, it shows that people's behaviour in choosing educational institutions is based on marketing stimuli provided by MI Azzainiyah II through several excellent services and programs provided to the community to be able to provide high appeal to the community to enrol their children. To the agency. Stimuli provided by madrasas are in the form of superior products or programs, prices, locations and promotions that are intensively carried out by madrasas. Communities as users and partners of madrasas are influenced by these stimuli, coupled with geographical, social, cultural and economic factors that can exert a strong influence to make madrasas the first choice for their children's education. This research provides recommendations on the importance of a deep understanding for education administrators of the various demands, needs, and complaints conveyed by the community to madrasas to improve the quality of their education continuously.

## Acknowledgement

Researchers would like to thank the Chancellor of Nurul Jadid University, who has assisted in the form of moral and financial support to researchers so that this research was completed correctly. In addition, the researchers also thanked the Dean of the Faculty of Islamic Religion, the Principal of the Madrasah and their staff who had assisted in carrying out this research.

#### References

- Agus Indra Purnama, Putu, and Nyoman Rasmen Adi, 'Green Marketing Dan Quality Brand Sebagai Prediktor Perilaku Konsumen Dan Dampaknya Terhadap Keputusan Pembelian Produk', *Jurnal Manajemen Bisnis*, 16.1 (2019), 185 <a href="https://doi.org/10.38043/jmb.v16i1.2027">https://doi.org/10.38043/jmb.v16i1.2027</a>
- Angranti, Wiwik, 'Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Menyekolahkan Anak Ke SMK Swasta Di Tenggarong', *INTELEGENSIA: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 5.1 (2020), 49–59
- Baharun, H, M Harmonis, A Amir, and ..., 'At-Tarbiyat: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam', *The Behavior Of Customers Choice In Educational Institutions*, 04.03 (2021), 1–14 <a href="http://jurnal.staiannawawi.com/index.php/At-Tarbiyat/article/view/331">http://jurnal.staiannawawi.com/index.php/At-Tarbiyat/article/view/331</a>
- Dea Chairyani, K.A Rahman, and Muazza, 'Pengaruh Biaya Pendidikan Terhadap Mutu Sekolah Di Sekolah Menengah Pertama Swasta', *Jurnal Visionary: Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Dibidang Administrasi Pendidikan*, 2022
- DWIYAMA, FAJRI, 'Brand Image: Upaya Memasarkan Pendidikan Bagi Lembaga Yang Kurang Mampu Bersaing', *Adaara: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 9.2 (2019), 880–91 <a href="https://doi.org/10.35673/ajmpi.v9i2.424">https://doi.org/10.35673/ajmpi.v9i2.424</a>>
- Efendi, Mukhlison, and Nur aini Latifah, 'Penetapan Harga Jasa Pendidikan Di Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Negeri (PTKIN)', *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 2.2 (2021) (2021), 127–43
- Fauzi, Fathul, 'Peningkatan Profesionalisme Guru Melalui Supervisi Klinis', EDUSIANA: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam, 7.2 (2020), 109–28
- Fredy, Fredy, Yonarlianto Tembang, and Ratna Purwanty, 'Analisis Kepuasan Orangtua Dan Siswa Terhadap Kualitas Layanan Pendidikan Dasar', *Musamus Journal of Primary Education*, 2.1 (2019), 59–66 <a href="https://doi.org/10.35724/musjpe.v2i1.1874">https://doi.org/10.35724/musjpe.v2i1.1874</a>
- Hadi, Abdul, 'Konsepsi Manajemen Mutu Dalam Pendidikan', *Idaarah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 2.2 (2018), 269

- <a href="https://doi.org/10.24252/idaarah.v2i2.5260">https://doi.org/10.24252/idaarah.v2i2.5260</a>
- Hakim, Faisol, and Yovita Dyah Permatasari, 'Tren: Pendidikan Tahfidz Qur'an Pada Anak Di Rumah Qur'an Ar-Roudhoh Rowotengah', *Auladuna: Jurnal Prodi Pendidikan Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 2.2 (2020), 19–26 <a href="https://doi.org/10.36835/au.v2i2.375">https://doi.org/10.36835/au.v2i2.375</a>
- Istanto, Istanto, 'Kepemimpinan Inovatif Kepala Madrasah Dalam Meningkatkan Daya Saing Madrasah', *Al Qalam: Jurnal Ilmiah Keagamaan Dan Kemasyarakatan*, 16.6 (2022), 1991–2006
- Jamil, M., Iman Jauhari, and Dahlan, 'The Response of Pesantren Community toward the Ideology of Islamism: A Study of Pesantren Teachers' Perception in North Sumatra', *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 10.2 (2019), 204–23
- Khaerunisa, Wina, Amirudin, Iqbal Amar Muzaki, and Moh Subhan, 'Pendidikan Islam Dalam Persepsi Masyarakat (Studi Kasus Di DTA Sirojul Falah II, Telukjambe', *Madrasah Sebagai Alternatif Pelaksanaan Pendidikan Islam Dalam Persepsi Masyarakat*, 8.2 (2021), 164–77
- Kusuma, I, Made Wijaya, I Wimba, Gusti Ayu, and Putu Yudy Wijaya, 'The Role of Brand Image and Brand Trust through Electronic Word of Mouth in Creating Parent's Interest to Sending Children to School', *Technium Soc. Sci. J.*, 35 (2022), 477
- Mutia, Intan, Wahyu Nur Cholifah, and others, 'Pemanfaatan Teknologi Interaktif Sebagai Media Pembelajaran Dan Promosi Sekolah', *Jurnal PkM* (Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat), 5.5 (2022), 487–93
- Nisa, Muria Khusnun, Ahmad Yani, Andika Andika, Eka Mulyo Yunus, and Yusuf Rahman, 'MODERASI BERAGAMA: Landasan Moderasi Dalam Tradisi Berbagai Agama Dan Implementasi Di Era Disrupsi Digital', *Jurnal Riset Agama*, 1.3 (2021), 79–96 <a href="https://doi.org/10.15575/jra.v1i3.15100">https://doi.org/10.15575/jra.v1i3.15100</a>>
- Novi Ariyanti, and Muhammad Anggung Manumanoso Prasetyo, 'Evaluasi Manajemen Hubungan Masyarakat Dan Sekolah (Studi Kasus Di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Miftahul Falah Purwodadi Pasuruan)', *Idarah (Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kependidikan)*, 5.2 (2021), 103–26 <a href="https://doi.org/10.47766/idarah.v5i2.133">https://doi.org/10.47766/idarah.v5i2.133</a>>
- Oktarini, Riri, and Rahmayanti, 'Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Keputusan ( Studi Empiris Pada Sma Imtek Pagedangan Tangerang)', *Jurnal Ikmiah Ilmu Sekertaris/Administrasi Perkantoran*, 7.2 (2020), 140–46
- Osman, Abu Rashed, Abu Saleh Md Sohel-Uz-zaman, Mohammad Ali Ashraf, and Aslam Uddin, 'Vindicating Service Quality of Education through Structural Equation Modeling (SEM): International Students' Perspective', International Journal of Higher Education, 9.3 (2020), 158–72 <a href="https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n3p158">https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n3p158</a>>
- Permana, Dian, and Hisam Ahyani, 'Implementasi Pendidikan Islam Dan Pendidikan Multikultural Pada Peserta Didik', *Jurnal Tawadhu*, 4.1 (2020), 995–1006
- Putra, Dewa Gede Agung Artha Swikara, Ni Wayan Eka Mitariani, and I Gusti Ayu Imbayani, 'Pengaruh Lokasi, Persepsi Harga Dan Citra Sekolah Terhadap Keputusan Orang Tua Murid Memilih Jasa Pendidikan Di Sekolah Dasar Jambe Agung Batubulan, *Jurnal Emas*, 2.April 2022 (2021), 51–70
- Roqib, Moh, 'Increasing Social Class through Islamic Boarding Schools in Indonesia', *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 12.2 (2021), 305–29
- Rosmaniar, Asyidatur, 'Pengaruh Bauran Pemasaran Jasa Terhadap Keputusan Siswa Memilih Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan Swasta Di Surabaya', *Journal Kinerja*, 16.1 (2019), 22–33

- Sari, W, and R Erwin, 'Analisis Respon Konsumen Terhadap Kualitas Pelayanan Pada Puskesmas Taraman Semendawai Suku lii Ogan Komering Ulu Timur', *Jurnal Trisnariset*, 1.2 (2021), 45
- Sholihah, Abdah Munfaridatus, and Windy Zakiya Maulida, 'Pendidikan Islam Sebagai Fondasi Pendidikan Karakter', *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, Dan Agama*, 12.01 (2020), 49–58 <a href="https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v12i01.214">https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v12i01.214</a>>
- Syamsul Arifin, 'Marketing Pendidikan', *Tadris: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pemikiran Pendidikan Islam*, 14.1 (2020), 112–23 <a href="https://doi.org/10.51675/jt.v14i1.75">https://doi.org/10.51675/jt.v14i1.75</a>
- Utama, Rahmad Faisal, 'Kajian Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Perilaku Konsumen Dalam Keputusan Pembelian Kopi Wine CK Street', *Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Pertanian*, 1.4 (2021), 1–15
- Wardoyo, Irvan Iswandi, and Kartini, 'Animo Orang Tua Menyekolahkan Anak Di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Nahdlotur Rijal Kroya Indramayu', *Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat Waradin*, 2.1 (2023), 35–49
- Winarno, Satrio, Lisbeth Mananeke, and W.J Imelda Ogi, 'Analisis Pelayanan Konsumen Dan Fasilitas Terhadap Kepuasan Konsumen Kedai Kopi Maxx Coffee Cabang Hotel Aryaduta Manado', *Jurnal Emba*, 6.3 (2018), 1248–57
- Wiyono, Bambang, 'Produk-Produk Jasa Pendidikan', *Intizam: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 3.2 (2020), 35–45
- Yuniawati, 'Pengaruh Guru Dan Teman Sebaya Terhadap Keputusan Peserta Didik Dalam Memilih Lembaga Bimbingan Belajar ( Studi Pada Lembaga Bimbingan Belajar Primagama Driyorejo Gresik )', *Jurnal Pendidikan Akuntansi, Universitas Negeri Surabaya*, 2015, 1–9